

Council Communication

Office of the City Manager

Date:	December 23, 2013
Agenda Item No.	53
Roll Call No.	[]
Communication No.	<u>13-618</u>
Submitted by:	Benjamin R. Page,
	Park and Recreation

Director

AGENDA HEADING:

Approving staff's recommendation to:

- 1) Budget for repairs of the Meredith Trail Southwest 1st Street Bridge within the next two (2) fiscal years; and
- 2) Restore the Meredith Trail Southwest 5th (Jackson) Street Bridge contingent upon structural and financial feasibility and success of all fundraising efforts.

SYNOPSIS:

Approving staff's recommendation to:

- 1) Budget Capital Improvement Program (CIP) funding of \$1,080,000 for repairs to the Meredith Trail Southwest 1st Street Bridge within the next two (2) years; and
- 2) Historically restore the Meredith Trail Southwest 5th (Jackson) Street Bridge to established safety standards for pedestrian bridges contingent upon:
 - a) \$750,000 being budgeted in the FY2017 CIP budget;
 - b) Engineers indicating structural feasibility for restoration following an in-depth, second engineering analysis that would build upon the report done by Shuck-Britson;
 - c) Engineers developing a cost estimate(s) for restoration of the bridge;
 - d) Staff and stakeholders determining financial feasibility of the bridge's restoration;
 - e) Stakeholders developing a fundraising plan utilizing private, non-profit, and other state or federal special appropriation funds for the balance of funds needed; and
 - f) Substantial fundraising being completed within 18 months after completion of the more detailed cost estimate in "c" above; if fundraising efforts are not successful or if the cost estimate is beyond an amount stakeholders feel is reasonable to obtain, the City will utilize the \$750,000 for demolition of the bridge.

FISCAL IMPACT:

Amount: Southwest 1st Street Bridge – \$1,080,000; and Southwest 5th (aka Jackson) Street Bridge \$750,000.

<u>Funding Source</u>: Southwest 1st Street Bridge – anticipated FY2015 and FY2016 CIP, PKS045, Multi-Use Trails; and Southwest 5th (aka Jackson) Street Bridge – anticipated FY2017 CIP, PKS045, Multi-Use Trails.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:

On November 26, 2013, by Resolution No. 13-092, the Park and Recreation Board received and filed staff's recommendation on the Southwest 5th (Jackson Street) and First Street Bridges. On December 16, 2013, by Resolution No. 13-100, the Des Moines Park and Recreation Board unanimously approved (14-0 with one (1) board member absent) staff's recommendation on the two (2) bridges.

The Meredith Trail includes two (2) trail bridges, the Southwest 1st Street Bridge and Southwest 5th (aka Jackson) Street Bridge. Structural evaluation reports for each of the bridges have been completed by structural engineers of Shuck-Britson, Inc. to identify necessary repairs or other measures to ensure the safety of the public. Staff's recommendation is based on Shuck-Britson's findings in addition to consideration of the historic significance of each bridge, trail connectivity, and the cost of repairs or other options.



Southwest 1st Street Bridge Recommendation

Formerly known as the Riverside Park Drive Bridge, the Southwest 1st Street Bridge was originally constructed in 1937 and was reconstructed in 1974. It was closed to vehicles in 2005 and converted to pedestrian usage as part of the Meredith Trail. It is a contributing structure to the National Register of Historic Places Civic Center Historic District, which consists of a group of buildings and structures constructed between 1900 and 1937, including the Argonne Armory and World War Memorial Building, Municipal Building (City Hall), U.S. Courthouse, Municipal Court and Public Safety Building (Police Station), U.S. Post Office (Polk County Administration Building) and Public Library (World Food Prize Hall of Laureates), along with the downtown Raccoon and Des Moines River walls, dams, bridges, and gardens. The monumental and beautiful architecture, landscaping, and urban design exemplify the City

Beautiful Movement that was intended to instill moral and civic virtue in urban populations and governments and was popular during that era in North America.

The Southwest 1st Street Bridge directly connects Principal Park stadium on the north and Mullets restaurant on the south, at the confluence of the Des Moines and Raccoon Rivers. The bridge is a popular link between the Meredith Trail and Principal Riverwalk on the north side of the Raccoon River and the new Des Moines River Trail on the south side of the Des Moines River and also to Gray's Lake Park via the Meredith Trail on the south side of the Raccoon River.

The structural evaluation of the Southwest 1st Street Bridge identified a prioritized list of repairs required to keep the bridge in service. The repairs include arch and transverse frame repairs, full-depth deck replacement at joint locations, expansion joint replacement, deck repairs, deck underside repairs, pier repairs, and sidewalk repairs. Staff recommends moving forward with these repairs, which are estimated to cost \$1,080,000, including engineering and construction costs, within approximately two (2) to three (3) years.

Southwest 5th (Jackson) Street Bridge Recommendation

According to the Historic American Engineering Record (established by the National Park Service, the American Society of Civil Engineers, and the Library of Congress), the Southwest 5th Street Bridge is one of Iowa's few remaining pinned Pratt through trusses with three (3) or more spans. A truss is a structure of connected elements forming triangular units. Constructed in 1898, it represents early urban wagon bridge construction. It was placed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1998. The Southwest 5th Street Bridge was retrofitted for pedestrian usage in 1998, and the trail construction began in 2004; City funding as well as private and grant funds were used for those repairs and enhancements.

The location of a bridge at Southwest 5th Street was first proposed in 1896, and was advocated by the Clifton Land Company, which owned large areas on the south side of Des Moines. The aldermen from the west side of town were proponents of a bridge at the Southwest 5th Street location, while those from the east were in favor of a bridge at East 6th Street. Ultimately, the ordinance that passed provided for the Southwest 5th Street Bridge to be built first and the East 6th Street Bridge to be constructed a year later.

A common, but illegal practice at the turn of the century was for bridge contractors to form "pools" or "combines," which led to a form of bid-rigging. They would work together to set the price and decide whom would get the bid; the winning contractor would pay off the losing bidders. In the case of the Southwest 5th Street Bridge, the contractor who was supposed to get the job according to the combine, the George King Bridge Company, was under-bid by another contractor, Mr. J.H. Killmar, by over \$5,000. In response to that low bid, another party, Mr. C. Jenney, secretary and treasurer for Oak and Highland Park Coal Company, filed a petition for an injunction against the bridge, naming J.H. Killmar, the City, and the board of public works in the suit. J.H. Killmar assumed that C. Jenney was acting on behalf of the George King Bridge Company. The judge granted the injunction, stating that the plans provided to the winning bidder were more detailed than the other bidders' plans. This decision was appealed to the Iowa Supreme Court, which reversed the decision. The bridge construction was delayed from 1896 to 1898 because of this suit.

The Southwest 5th Street Bridge connects the Meredith Trail to the north and south sides of the Raccoon River. It is located approximately a third of a mile west of the Southwest 1st Street Bridge. On the south side of the bridge, the trail is unable to directly connect farther south to the rest of the City due to privately owned property located between the trail and the street network; instead users must continue

easterly on the Meredith Trail a third of a mile to further connect to the south. On the north end, users must traverse a levee to access Southwest 5th Street and the downtown area.

Shuck-Britson's report identified advanced deterioration and corrosion of structural elements as well as other concerns including their inability to fully inspect all areas and uncertainty of the status of previous repairs. In the interest of safety, the City closed the Southwest 5th Street Bridge in March 2013.

The report also provided information regarding various possible courses of action - restoration and retention of the historical integrity of the bridge; replacement of the existing trusses with pre-fabricated ones as well as replacement of the deck, stringers and rail; or complete replacement of the bridge. The cost estimates ranged from \$3.74 million for the first option to \$1.75 million for the second and \$2 million for the third (25% has been added for engineering costs).

Staff has derived an estimated cost to remove the bridge, dispose of the materials, and modify the bridge approach from the information provided by the report. Their projection is \$750,000, with an additional 15% rather than 25% being added for engineering costs since removal would require less engineering involvement.

Following the November 26, 2013 Park and Recreation Board meeting, which included discussion on this item, interested parties came forward indicating a willingness to coordinate an additional evaluation and cost estimate for restoration of the bridge. Given this fact, staff is recommending the first option outlined in the report - historic restoration of the Southwest 5th (Jackson) Street Bridge to established safety standards for pedestrian bridges contingent upon:

- a) \$750,000 being budgeted in the FY2017 CIP budget;
- b) Engineers indicating structural feasibility for restoration following an in-depth, second engineering analysis that would build upon the report done by Shuck-Britson;
- c) Engineers developing a cost estimate(s) for restoration of the bridge;
- d) Staff and stakeholders determining financial feasibility of the bridge's restoration;
- e) Stakeholders developing a fundraising plan utilizing private, non-profit, and other state or federal special appropriation funds for the balance of funds needed; and
- f) Substantial fundraising being completed within 18 months after completion of the more detailed cost estimate in "c" above.

If fundraising efforts are not successful, or if the cost estimate is beyond an amount stakeholders feel is reasonable to obtain, the City will utilize the \$750,000 for demolition of the bridge.

Removal of the bridge is the least desirable outcome; however, staff must develop a plan to be in place should removal become necessary. They will therefore begin discussions with pertinent granting and regulatory agencies with regard to factors relating to potential removal of the bridge.

PREVIOUS COUNCIL ACTION(S):

Date: June 25, 2012

Roll Call Number: 12-0962

<u>Action</u>: <u>Approving</u> Professional Services Agreement with Shuck-Britson, Inc. for the Jackson Street Trail Bridge Phase 1 Bridge Rehabilitation Evaluation, not to exceed \$49,376. (<u>Council Communication</u> No. 12-339) Moved by Hensley to adopt. Motion carried 7-0.

Date: February 26, 2007

Roll Call Number: 07-0325

Action: Accepting completed construction and approving final payment for the following:

(A) <u>Grimes</u> Asphalt and Paving Corporation American Discovery Trail – Riverpoint Segment. Moved by Hensley to adopt. Motion carried 6-1.

Date: October 10, 2005

Roll Call Number: 05-2425

<u>Action</u>: Approving completion and acceptance of the private construction contract for trail enhancements improvements, Meredith Trail enhancements, between the Hansen Company, Inc. and Meredith Corporation Foundation. Moved by Hensley to Adopt. Motion carried 7-0.

BOARD/COMMISSION ACTION(S):

Board: Park and Recreation Board

<u>Date</u>: December 16, 2013

Resolution Number: 13-100

Action: Approve staff's recommendation to:

- 1) Budget Capital Improvement Program (CIP) funding of \$1,080,000 for repairs to the Meredith Trail Southwest 1st Street Bridge within the next two (2) years; and
- 2) Historically restore the Meredith Trail Southwest 5th (Jackson) Street Bridge to established safety standards for pedestrian bridges contingent upon:
- a) \$750,000 being budgeted in the FY2017 CIP budget;
- b) engineers indicating structural feasibility for restoration following an in-depth, second engineering analysis that would build upon the report done by Shuck-Britson;
- c) engineers developing a cost estimate(s) for restoration of the bridge;
- d) staff and stakeholders determining financial feasibility of the bridge's restoration;
- e) stakeholders developing a fundraising plan utilizing private, non-profit, and other State or Federal special appropriation funds for the balance of funds needed; and
- substantial fundraising being completed within 18 months after completion of the more detailed cost estimate in "c" above; if fundraising efforts are not successful or if the cost estimate is beyond an amount stakeholders feel is reasonable to obtain, the City will utilize the \$750,000 for demolition of the bridge.

Board: Park and Recreation Board

Date: November 26, 2013

Resolution Number: 13-092

Action: Receive and file staff's recommendation to 1) budget Capital Improvement Program (CIP) funding of \$1,080,000 for repairs to the Southwest 1st Street Bridge within the next two (2) years and 2) begin discussions with granting and regulatory agencies that are pertinent to removal of the Southwest 5th (aka Jackson) Street Bridge, budget CIP funding of \$750,000 for removal of the bridge in approximately three (3) years, and accept outside fundraising efforts to complete the funds necessary to instead restore, repair or replace the bridge.

ANTICIPATED ACTIONS AND FUTURE COMMITMENTS:

Budget Capital Improvement Program (CIP) funding of \$1,080,000 for repairs to the Meredith Trail Southwest 1st Street Bridge within the next two (2) years; and budget CIP funding of \$750,000 in the FY2017 CIP budget for the Meredith Trail Southwest 5th (Jackson) Street Bridge for use as indicated in the synopsis above.

For more information on this and other agenda items, please call the City Clerk's Office at 515-283-4209 or visit the Clerk's Office on the first floor of City Hall, 400 Robert D. Ray Drive. Council agendas are available to the public at the City Clerk's Office on Thursday afternoon preceding Monday's Council meeting. Citizens can also request to receive meeting notices and agendas by email by calling the Clerk's Office or sending their request via email to cityclerk@dmgov.org.