

**Agenda Item Number** 

-----

Date May 4, 2015

#### RECEIVE AND FILE COMMUNICATION FROM THE PLAN AND ZONING COMMISSION REGARDING APPROVAL OF A PRELIMINARY PLAT AMENDMENT FOR "CARMAN ESTATES", ON PROPERTY LOCATED AT 2314 E. PORTER AVENUE

WHEREAS, on April 16, 2015, the City of Des Moines Plan and Zoning Commission voted 9-3 to **APPROVE** a request from Silver Oak Enterprises, LLC (owner), represented by Ron Grubb (officer), for a Preliminary Plat amendment to "Carman Estates", on property located at 2314 E. Porter Avenue, to allow division of the property into five (5) lots to accommodate a proposed 96-unit multi-family residential development that includes four 3-story apartment buildings, a clubhouse structure, and single-story detached garage structures, subject to the following conditions, all as stated in the attached communication from the Commission:

- 1. Compliance with all comments of the administrative review by the Permit and Development Center.
- 2. Mitigation of trees identified to be removed by the Iowa Arborist's report as part of any grading or Site Plan development of the property.
- 3. Provision of conservation easements on the three identified Outlots for protection of remaining timbered areas following grading, storm water management and utility installation.
- 4. Revision of the public sanitary sewer slope to a minimum of 1%; and

WHEREAS, the final subdivision plat will be submitted for City Council approval when completed.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED,** by the City Council of the City of Des Moines, Iowa, that the attached communication from the City Plan and Zoning Commission is hereby received and filed.

MOVED by \_\_\_\_\_\_\_ to receive and file.

APPROVED:

Glenna K. Frank Assistant City Attorney

(13-2015-1.21)

COUNCIL ACTION	YEAS	NAYS	PASS	ABSENT
COWNIE				
COLEMAN				
GATTO				
GRAY				
HENSLEY				
MAHAFFEY	1			
MOORE				
TOTAL				
MOTION CARRIED		AP	APPROVED	

CERTIFICATE

, DIANE RAUH, City Clerk of said City hereby ertify that at a meeting of the City Council of said City of Des Moines, held on the above date, among other proceedings the above was adopted.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my seal the day and year first above written.

\_ Mayor



April 27, 2015

Honorable Mayor and City Council City of Des Moines, Iowa

Members:

Communication from the City Plan and Zoning Commission advising that at their meeting held April 16, 2015, the following action was taken regarding a request from Silver Oak Enterprises, LLC (owner) represented by Ron Grubb (officer) for review and approval of a Preliminary Plat amendment to "Carman Estates", on property located at 2314 E. Porter Avenue.

### **COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION:**

After public hearing, the members voted 9-3 as follows:

Commission Action:	Yes	Nays	Pass	Absent
Dory Briles	Х	·		
JoAnne Corigliano	Х			
Jacqueline Easley	Х			
Tim Fitzgerald		Х		
Jann Freed	Х			
John "Jack" Hilmes	Х			
Greg Jones	Х			
Sasha Kamper	Х			
William Page				Х
Jonathan Rosenbloom		Х		
Mike Simonson				Х
CJ Stephens		Х		
Vicki Stogdill	Х			
Greg Wattier	Х			

**APPROVAL** of the requested amendment to the Carman Estates PUD Conceptual Plan subject to providing the following revisions: (13-2015-1.21)

1. Compliance with all comments of the administrative review by the Permit and Development Center.

- 2. Mitigation of trees identified to be removed by the Iowa Arborist's report as part of any grading or Site Plan development of the property.
- 3. Provision of conservation easements on the three identified Outlots for protection of remaining timbered areas following grading, storm water management and utility installation.
- 4. Revision of the public sanitary sewer slope to a minimum of 1%.

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO THE P&Z COMMISSION

Staff recommends approval of the requested amendment to the Carman Estates PUD Conceptual Plan subject to providing the following revisions:

- 1. Compliance with all comments of the administrative review by the Permit and Development Center.
- 2. Mitigation of trees identified to be removed by the Iowa Arborist's report as part of any grading or Site Plan development of the property.
- 3. Provision of conservation easements on the three identified Outlots for protection of remaining timbered areas following grading, storm water management and utility installation.
- 4. Revision of the public sanitary sewer slope to a minimum of 1%.

# STAFF REPORT TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION

### I. GENERAL INFORMATION

- Purpose of Request: The developer is seeking to subdivide Outlot Z of Carman Estates Plat 4. This would create five lots for development and three Outlots. This requires an amendment to the overall Carman Estates Preliminary Plat to demonstrate further subdivision of the property. The subdivision would be in accordance with the approved 5<sup>th</sup> Amendment to the Carman Estates PUD Conceptual Plan to allow development of 96-units of multiple-family residential property and a clubhouse. Each proposed building would have a separate development lot.
- **2. Size of Site:** Area of the amendment request for Outlot Z of Carman Estates Plat 4 is 16.72 acres. The Carman Estates PUD is an approximate total of 107 acres.
- 3. Existing Zoning (site): "PUD" Planned Unit Development.
- 4. Existing Land Use (site): Agricultural and timber area.
- 5. Adjacent Land Use and Zoning:

North - "R1-80", Use is City of Des Moines Ewing Park.

South – "PUD", Uses are multiple-family residential condominium dwellings.

*East* – "PUD", Uses are undeveloped land and single-family dwellings.

### West - "R1-80", Use is City of Des Moines Ewing Park.

- 6. General Neighborhood/Area Land Uses: The subject area of the amendment is located in the Carman Estates mixed-density residential community located along Indianola Avenue south of Easter Lake Drive within the Easter Lake New Town area.
- 7. Applicable Recognized Neighborhood(s): The subject property is located in the Easter Lake Area Neighborhood. This neighborhood association was notified of the meeting by mailing of the Preliminary Agenda to all recognized neighborhood associations on March 27, 2014. Additionally, separate notifications of the hearing for this specific item were mailed on April 6, 2015 (10 days prior to the hearing) to the Easter Lake Area Neighborhood Association and to the primary titleholder on file with the Polk County Assessor for each property within 250 feet of the Preliminary Plat amendment boundary. A Final Agenda for the meeting was mailed to all the recognized neighborhood associations on April 10, 2015.

All agendas and notices are mailed to the primary contact person designated to the City of Des Moines Neighborhood Development Division by the recognized neighborhood association. The Easter Lake Area Neighborhood notices were mailed to Jim Bollard, 4007 SE 26<sup>th</sup> Street, Des Moines, IA 50320.

- 8. Relevant Zoning History: The property was rezoned to "PUD" Planned Unit Development as part of the approval of the Carman Estates Conceptual Plan on June 18, 2001. Since that time, the Conceptual Plan has been amended four previous times to define development:
  - 1<sup>st</sup> Amendment, September 23, 2002, for 96-units within two-story multiple-family dwellings and 64 units of single-family semi-detached dwellings in vicinity of East Porter Avenue and SE 24<sup>th</sup> Street.
  - 2<sup>nd</sup> Amendment, July 14, 2003, for 83-units of two-story row townhome dwellings along Hart Avenue between Indianola Avenue and SE 24<sup>th</sup> Street, including reducing 8 previously approved single-family semi-detached dwellings.
  - 3<sup>rd</sup> Amendment, October 11, 2004, for 96-units of two-story multiple-family dwellings northeast of East Payton Avenue and SE 24<sup>th</sup> Street.

/3

- 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment, February 26, 2007, for 76-units of single-story row townhomes north east of East Payton Avenue and Indianola Avenue.
- 5<sup>th</sup> Amendment, February 23, 2015, for 96 multiple-family residential apartments within four 3-story, 24-unit apartment buildings and a private community center to serve residents within the development.

- **9. 2020 Community Character Land Use Plan Designation:** Medium Density Residential and Open Space (private).
- **10. Applicable Regulations:** The Commission shall determine if the preliminary plat conforms to the standards and requirements outlined in Chapter 354 of the Iowa Code and in consideration of the criteria set forth in Chapter 18B of the Iowa Code. The Commission shall also determine if it conforms to the City Subdivision Ordinance and shall approve, conditionally approve or reject such plat within 45 days after the date of submission to the City Permit and Development Center. Unless the applicant agrees in writing to an extension of time, the preliminary plat shall be deemed approved if the Commission does not act within such 45-day period. The Commission's action for approval or conditional approval shall be null and void unless the final plat is submitted to the City Permit and Development Center within 270 days after the date of such action; provided, however, that the Permit and Development Administrator may grant, upon written request of the applicant, up to a 90-day extension for submittal of the final plat to the City Permit and Development Center.

### II. ADDITIONAL APPLICABLE INFORMATION

1. Natural Site Features: The majority of the subject property is undeveloped timber. The proposed development is focused to the higher topography on a ridge which is not as heavily timbered. Disturbance of the timber and brush areas is proposed to be focused to trees outside the driveway access, buildings and parking areas. In order to comply with all current tree protection and mitigation provisions in the Subdivision Ordinance, the developer has submitted a tree inventory and analysis for the property prepared by Mark Dungan, a consulting Iowa Arborist. The conclusion of the study indicated that there were five (5) trees proposed for removal that would require mitigation under the requirements of the City's Subdivision Ordinance: three Oak specimens (43", 40", and 36" diameter at breast height or D.B.H.); one Hackberry specimen (13" D.B.H), and one crabapple (12" D.B.H). This will require a minimum of 17 tree plantings for mitigation. The multiple-family Site Plan will be required to meet or exceed this number of plantings.

Staff recommends that the proposed Outlot areas be covered with conservation easements preventing further grading and tree removal after the construction and installation of storm water management improvements and utility extensions.

2. Drainage/Grading: The overall area for the Carman Estates PUD drains north or northeast. A portion of the storm water is managed by a regional detention basin to the northeast of the PUD along Easter Lake Drive. The remaining portion is handled by a private detention ponds with Carman Estates. Engineering staff in the review of the submitted Plat has indicated that the developer is required to also comply Section 106-136 of the City Code by entering a Stormwater Management Facilities Agreement with the City. The developer is also required to obtain a grading permit issued by the Permit and Development Center before commencing on any grading of the property. A grading permit will not be issued until the Iowa DNR is issued an NPDES permit from the Iowa DNR.

- **3. Utilities:** All necessary utilities are generally available to the proposed development by extension of services from the surrounding development. Engineering staff has reviewed the utilities plans and has indicated the need to modify the slope of the public sanitary sewer profile to ensure a minimum of 1% is achieved.
- 4. Traffic/Street System: There are no proposed modifications to the surrounding public street network. Easements for shared access amongst the development lots are shown to allow private driveway access and circulation. Separate from the subject Preliminary Plat, the developer will also be extending Southeast 24<sup>th</sup> Street to Easter Lake Drive as part of approval of Carman Estates Plat 9. This has been proposed out of concern raised by neighbors during the PUD amendment process that a secondary connection to the north was necessary before development of the proposed multiple-family units for the subject property. The SE 24<sup>th</sup> Street connection to Easter Lake Drive will be completed prior to issuance of any Certificate of Occupancy for any multiple-family dwellings on the subject property.

#### SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION

Erik Lundy presented the staff report and recommendation.

<u>Mike Ludwig</u> reiterated that the platting of the lot is a technical review of whether the plat complies with the subdivision regulations for lot width, depths etc. Staff is confident that the proposal complies with the subdivision regulations. Prior to final plat approval, the grading can commence if they post all of their bonds and they could potentially start with foundations for the building. The final plat would go to Council after they have the foundations. Also, the zoning, use, site layout and architecture have already been approved by the City Council.

<u>Jonathan Rosenbloom</u> wanted to be sure he understood everything and asked if the prior approvals currently allow the subject area one development of 96 units?

Mike Ludwig stated yes.

Jonathan Rosenbloom asked what the map of this area previously looked like.

<u>Erik Lundy</u> stated Easter Lake New Town Plan and the Carman Estates PUD had established it as an area reserved for medium density residential use.

<u>Chip Classon</u> Jerry's Homes 10430 New York Avenue Urbandale IA stated they are dividing the lots for financing purposes. The project is large enough that multiple banks wants their individual parcel. He believes that all of the subdivision regulations have been met.

Jonathan Rosenbloom asked for a status report on Plats 7, 9 and 10.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated Plat 7 has been engineered but it is an empty space. Plat 9 contains 19 lots and has been submitted to engineering. Those 19 lots will be built before and simultaneously with this project. So there will be 19 lots going in as well as the apartments at the same time. Plat 10 will be based on sales performance.

Jonathan Rosenbloom asked if trees have been removed from the area of Plat 10.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated they did not clear cut it but it is an open area. He also explained that the buildings are going to go up at the same time due to the possibility of multi-family tax abatement may go away at the end of calendar year 2015.

Greg Wattier asked why the development is in the middle as opposed to on an edge.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated the Easter Lake New Town Plan originally identified that middle area because a lessor amount of trees would be impacted.

<u>Mike Ludwig</u> clarified that one of staff's condition on this plat is that the road connecting\_SE 24<sup>th</sup> Street will be constructed and connect to Easter Lake Drive before any certificate of occupancy would be issued for any of the multi-family development.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated they will begin grading on both of them simultaneously and before any occupancies can be allowed on the apartments the street will be in. Currently, there are three people working on contracts for single-family dwellings in Plat 9, which shows there is demand there.

Sasha Kamper asked about the arborist the applicant hired.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated he is an independent arborist, he works for Polk County and is an arborist the City of Des Moines has used multiple times.

Erik Lundy stated the arborist possesses Iowa Certification #MW0177.

CJ Stephens stated the arborist is a Consulting Iowa Arborist.

<u>Tim Fitzgerald</u> asked if tax credits would be used for these units, or if they would be government subsidized.

Chip Classon stated these are100% market rate apartments with no tax credits.

### CHAIRPERSON OPENED THE PUBLIC HEARING

<u>Judy Shepard</u> Carmen Estates stated her concern with amendments is that the neighbors are getting the short end of the stick. Property value has gone down because of the apartments in this area and increased traffic continues to be an issue.

<u>Linda Hendricks</u> 5505 SE 24<sup>th</sup> stated the traffic is already very congested in that area. There are two exits that go out to SE Porter across from where the new apartments will be built. At the meeting in February, her understanding was there would be another outlet besides the Porter outlet. One that would allow traffic to go out to SE 24<sup>th</sup> directly, rather than come out to Porter and go east to SE 24<sup>th</sup> to then north. There was going to be another outlet somewhere behind the apartments onto SE 24<sup>th</sup>. She believes those 96 units are going to have at least 2 cars per unit and parked all up and down Porter on the side of

the street they can park on. This is already a congested area. Her hope is that something can be done about the traffic that this is causing.

<u>Robert Whicker</u> 2323 E. Porter stated his concern is the property value. His property value has gone down over \$17,000 in value in 10 years. He is concerned about bringing in renters who historically according to two separate realtors he has talked to will bring down property values due to the transient nature of renters. He is concerned that they will not keep up the appearance of the rental properties and he believes it is not a good idea. If they were single-family homes or townhomes or something like that he would not feel the same way. He noted that Jerry Homes had a second set of condos that were not completed and now most of those are rental properties. He does not want to have apartment blight in his neighborhood.

Laura Whicker 2818 SE Millard stated she is concerned with apartment blight and property value. Good neighborhoods need to be built on the south side, it's becoming the ugly step child of Des Moines. A stand needs to be taken and not continue apartments unless they are serving a special needs purpose such as seniors or disabled people. This project will not serve that purpose and probably end up be subsidized when the vacancy level becomes too high. She is very unhappy with the growth of apartments on the south side.

#### Rebuttal

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated he understands the neighborhood's concern but emphasize that tonight is not a decision about whether or not apartments can go in or not. The PUD has already been approved by the City Council. He is there tonight about the Preliminary Plat and creating parcels for each apartment building, the club house and the outlots that will be a conservation development.

<u>Jonathan Rosenbloom</u> asked why the value of the residential market in that area is going down and if it is true can something be done about it.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated he cannot answer that question, but he thinks that everybody has taken a hit and all are growing slowly. He is not sure if they are talking about the assessed value or a market value. If they put their house on the market. He pointed out that they have now sold a lot of houses on Easter Lake, they are selling out of their other plats that are in Carmen Estates and they are willing to put 19 more single-family houses right next to the apartment buildings. They don't feel like there is a drop in value, if that were the case they would not risk putting 19 new lots in with brand new housing. He believes that their property value declines are not directly caused by apartment buildings in the area.

<u>Sasha Kamper</u> asked what the residents were talking about with respect to the condos not being finished.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated the buildings down by East Payton originally were condos and for sale. However, like many developers when the market crashed condos either could not be sold or financed because of the new laws. Condos had to be converted to apartments.

<u>Sasha Kamper</u> asked what assistance they can give the neighbors that this property will be finished.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated the other condos on Payton were stopped because it was market driven in terms of they had to sell them in order to move forward with the next building. These buildings will all be constructed in at the same time because of the tax abatement and these are apartments to begin with.

Greg Wattier asked if these outlots need to remain wooded and not-built on.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated that once the construction is done the outlots will be covered by a conservation easement. These will only be 96 units. They can never come back and build anything again on this property.

<u>Greg Wattier</u> stated he does not believe that apartments cause property values to go down. There are apartments in Des Moines that have great property values. They create walkable areas and connect neighborhoods. He asked would they consider creating trails or amenities within the outlots or something that would help the neighborhood feel.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated it all connects out to East Porter and there is a trail all along East Porter itself. Within the conservation easements the topography and staff's wish to have as many trees remaining as possible is not conducive to adding trails.

<u>CJ Stephens</u> stated she applauds the applicant's conservation areas but she also knows that that area is not buildable. It is a naturally deep wooded area.

<u>Mike Ludwig</u> pointed out that single-family houses can be rented. Even if a product in a condo was purchased and owned by an individual, they can still get a rental certificate and rent out a unit.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated that being an apartment project, part of everybody's rent goes into a professional management company who is there taking care of the product. It is not an individual home owner where this may get run down.

<u>Tim Fitzgerald</u> asked the name of the management company that will be taking care of this product, because it makes a huge difference on multi-family housing and whether or not he would support a project. His concern is there are a lot of management companies that cause property values to go down.

<u>Chip Classon</u> stated they are not sure at this time who will be the management company for this product. The management company is usually bid every year once the property is up. They use reputable large companies such as Terrus Management who does quite a few of their properties.

# CHAIRPERSON CLOSED THE PUBLIC HEARING

<u>Jonathan Rosenbloom</u> stated his concern that Plats 7, 9 and 10 are vacant lots because they were cut. He believes that the vacancy on the lots are not good for the neighbors real estate values and would not endorse a plan that would result in these lots ending up in the same place. He asked that an amendment be in place that these lots cannot be clear cut and cleaned off until financing is in place.

<u>Mike Ludwig</u> stated that Lots 7, 9 and 10 were farmland. The applicant has to post a grading and restoration bond on the property. That does not restore a tree that has been taken down, but there would be mitigation required on the site.

<u>Erik Lundy</u> stated the restoration bond is the legislative safe guard in the PUD process, in the event for some reason the developer walks away from the development before it is completed. Everything shown for the future Plats are in accordance with that initial Carmen Preliminary Plat. This particular property was shown as an outlot on the original plat.

Vicki Stogdill asked about the entrance and exit going over to SE 24<sup>th</sup>.

<u>Erik Lundy</u> stated the PUD approved by City Council did not require that. It could have been something that was suggested as a remedy when the concern was brought up in the hearing or it might have been confused with the fact that the applicant agreed to connect SE 24<sup>th</sup> from Porter Avenue to Easter Lake Drive.

<u>CJ Stephens</u> asked if there have been a traffic or school capacity studies on this area.

<u>Erik Lundy</u> stated that traffic information is provided during the PUD Concept Plan Phase at the front end when the original concept plan is done and on any individual site development if the Traffic Engineering staff believes there is a concern about the traffic. No concerns were noted by the Traffic and Transportation Division.

<u>Mike Ludwig</u> stated the schools get notice of the PUD and you go online and look at the District's total capacity versus their enrollment, there is capacity in the school district. It would be very difficult to prohibit students from open enrolling out of the district and allowing students to open enroll into the district if there wasn't capacity district wide.

<u>Tim Fitzgerald</u> noted that directly across the street from this site is the Lilac Arboretum in Ewing Park.

### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

<u>John "Jack" Hilmes</u> moved staff recommendation to approve the requested amendment to the Carman Estates PUD Conceptual Plan subject to providing the following revisions:

- 1. Compliance with all comments of the administrative review by the Permit and Development Center.
- 2. Mitigation of trees identified to be removed by the Iowa Arborist's report as part of any grading or Site Plan development of the property.

- 3. Provision of conservation easements on the three identified Outlots for protection of remaining timbered areas following grading, storm water management and utility installation.
- 4. Revision of the public sanitary sewer slope to a minimum of 1%.

2

Motion passed 9-3 (Jonathan Rosenbloom, Tim Fitzgerald and CJ Stephens voted in opposition.

Respectfully submitted,

Michael Ludwig, AICP Planning Administrator

MGL:clw

Attachment

Silver Oak Enterprises, LLC (owner) represented by Ron Grubb (officer) on property located at 2314 E. Porter Avenue.						File # 13-2015-1.21	
Description of Action Approval of a Preliminary Plat amendment for "Carman Estates", to allow division of the property into five (5) lots to accommodate a proposed 96-unit multi-family residential development that includes four 3-story apartment buildings, a clubhouse structure, and single- story detached garage structures subject to providing revisions.							
2020 Commun Character Plar		Current: Medium Density Residential and Park/Open Space – Private. Proposed: N/A.					
a a agus a a su a su <del>a</del> nn a a s	bilizing TomorrowEast Indianola Avenue Widening from 2 lanes to 4 lanes.ansportation PlanEaster Lake Drive Widening.					•	
Current Zoning District							
Proposed Zoning District		N/A.					
Consent Card Inside Outside	Area	In Favo	r	Not In Favor	Undetermined	% Opposition	
Plan and Zonii Commission A			}	Required 6/7 the City Cour		x	

Silver Oak Enterprises, LLC, 2314 East Porter Avenue

ł

13-2015-1.21











