

★ **Roll Call Number**

12-0630

Agenda Item Number

37B

ALTERNATE RESOLUTION

Date April 23, 2012

RESOLUTION REVERSING THE DECISION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION TO CONDITIONALLY APPROVE A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE REPLACEMENT OF TEN WINDOWS IN THE MULTIPLE-FAMILY DWELLING AT 826 18TH STREET

WHEREAS, on November 30, 2011, the Historic Preservation Commission conditionally approved an application from Conlin Properties for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of ten first floor windows in the multiple-family dwelling at 826 18th Street, subject to the following conditions:

1. The windows shall be constructed of wood with no metal cladding.
2. The windows shall be of the same general style, shape and dimensions as the existing windows.
3. Review and approval of the selected window product by staff prior to installation.

WHEREAS, pursuant to §58-31(f) of the Des Moines Municipal Code, Conlin Properties has appealed the conditions imposed by the Historic Preservation Commission and seeks to be allowed to use double-paned, double-locked, energy-efficient vinyl windows of the type that have already been installed in 5 of the windows to be replaced; and

WHEREAS, on January 23, 2012, by Roll Call No. 12-0084, it was duly resolved by the City Council that the appeal be set down for hearing on February 13, 2012, at 5:00 p.m., in the Council Chambers; and,

WHEREAS, due notice of the hearing was published in the Des Moines Register on January 26, 2012, and a copy of the notice was provided to the attorney for Conlin Properties; and,

WHEREAS, on February 13, 2012, by Roll Call No. 12-0239, and on March 12, 2012, by Roll Call No. 12-0420, and on April 9, 2012, by Roll Call No. 12-0552, the City Council continued the public hearing until April 23, 2012, at 5:00 p.m., at the request of Conlin Properties; and,

WHEREAS, in accordance with the said notice, those interested in the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness, both for and against, have been given opportunity to be heard with respect thereto and have presented their views to the City Council; and,

WHEREAS, Section 303.34(3) of the Iowa Code and Section 58-31(f) of the Des Moines Municipal Code provide that on an appeal such as this, the City Council shall consider whether the Historic Preservation Commission has exercised its powers and followed the guidelines established by the law and ordinance, and whether the Commission's decision was patently arbitrary or capricious; NOW THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, by the City Council of the City of Des Moines, Iowa, as follows:

1. The public hearing on the appeal is hereby closed.

(continued)

★ **Roll Call Number**

12-0630

Agenda Item Number

37B

-2-

Date April 23, 2012

2. The portion of the decision of the Historic Preservation Commission requiring that the replacement windows satisfy the three conditions identified above is hereby reversed. A Certificate of Appropriateness is hereby granted for the replacement of the ten windows in the multiple-family dwelling with the vinyl windows, as more specifically described in the application.

3. The City Council hereby finds that the decision of the Historic Preservation Commission to require the replacement windows to satisfy the three conditions identified above was patently arbitrary or capricious for the following reasons:
 - a) The replacement of the windows in question was initiated by the applicant in response to a Section 8 Housing Inspection Summary Report issued by the Des Moines Municipal Housing Authority for an inspection of the property that occurred on September 7, 2011. That report ordered the repair/replacement of portions of a number of the first floor windows.
 - b) The windows to be replaced are non-original windows that are located in an addition to the structure constructed sometime between 1920 and 1957, and do not have any historical, architectural or cultural value.
 - c) The original home was converted into a multiple-family dwelling and substantially altered sometime prior to 1957, and currently has steel siding.
 - d) Replacing the ten windows with wood windows would cost over \$12,000, nearly twice the \$6,275.74 cost of the more secure, energy efficient windows that Conlin Properties seeks to install.

MOVED by _____ to adopt, and reverse in part the decision of the Historic Preservation Commission as identified above.

FORM APPROVED:

(Council Communication No. 12-)

Roger K Brown
 Roger K. Brown, Assistant City Attorney

C:\Rog\Historic\Appeals\Conlin\RC Hrg Reverse.doc

COUNCIL ACTION	YEAS	NAYS	PASS	ABSENT
COWNIE				
COLEMAN				
GRIESS				
HENSLEY				
MAHAFFEY				
MEYER				
MOORE				
TOTAL				

MOTION CARRIED

APPROVED

 Mayor

CERTIFICATE

I, DIANE RAUH, City Clerk of said City hereby certify that at a meeting of the City Council of said City of Des Moines, held on the above date, among other proceedings the above was adopted.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and affixed my seal the day and year first above written.

 City Clerk